Constructing the extended Haagerup planar algebra

http://arxiv.org/abs/0909.4099

Emily Peters
joint work with Stephen Bigelow, Scott Morrison and Noah Snyder

University of New Hampshire

WCOAS 2009, Reno, October 17 2009
Outline

1. Small-index subfactors
2. Planar algebras
3. Constructing the extended Haagerup planar algebra
   - Finding a generator \( S \)
   - Relations on \( S \)
   - What does \( S \) generate?
Invariants of subfactors

$N$ is a subfactor of $M$: $1 \in N \subset M$ is an inclusion of $\text{II}_1$ factors. Three invariants of $N \subset M$, from weakest to strongest:

- the *index* measures the relative size of $N$;
  \[
  [M : N] \in \{4 \cos \left(\frac{\pi}{n}\right)^2 \mid n = 3, 4, 5, \ldots\} \cup [4, \infty]
  \]

- the *principal graph* describes tensor product rules of $N, M$-bimodules. If $X = N M_\mathcal{M}$, and $A$ and $B$ are irreducible bimodules, there is an edge from $A$ to $B$ if $B \subset A \otimes X$.

- the *standard invariant* is a family of algebras, with diagrammatic structure. Specifically $V_k = \text{End}_{N, M}(X \otimes k)$.

Theorems of Popa and Jones allow us to move between subfactors and planar algebras (sometimes).
Which graphs are principal graphs?

Subfactors with \([M : N] \leq 4\) have Dynkin diagrams or extended Dynkin diagrams as principal graphs.

**Question**

*What are principal graphs for (finite-depth) subfactors with index slightly more than 4?*

Haagerup (1994) found two families of candidates and one additional candidate, having index between 4 and \(3 + \sqrt{3}\).
Classification of small-index subfactors

- Haagerup’s possible principal graphs for subfactors with index less than $3 + \sqrt{3}$:
Classification of small-index subfactors

- Haagerup’s possible principal graphs for subfactors with index less than $3 + \sqrt{3}$:
  - , , , ...
  - ,
  - , , , ...

- Haagerup and Asaeda & Haagerup (1999) constructed two of these possibilities.
Classification of small-index subfactors

- Haagerup’s possible principal graphs for subfactors with index less than $3 + \sqrt{3}$:
  
  ![](image.png)

- Haagerup and Asaeda & Haagerup (1999) constructed two of these possibilities.

Classification of small-index subfactors

- Haagerup’s possible principal graphs for subfactors with index less than $3 + \sqrt{3}$:
  - , , ..., , , ...

- Haagerup and Asaeda & Haagerup (1999) constructed two of these possibilities.


- Today, we construct the missing example (‘extended Haagerup’), and complete the classification.
A planar algebra is

- a family of vector spaces \( \{ V_{i,\pm} \}_{i \in \mathbb{Z}_{\geq 0}} \)
- on which ‘planar tangles’ act; for example,

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\begin{tikzpicture}
\node (1) at (0,0) {1};
\node (2) at (-2,-2) {2};
\node (3) at (2,-2) {3};
\end{tikzpicture}
\end{array}
\]

\[
\text{gives a map } V_{1,+,+} \otimes V_{2,+,+} \otimes V_{2,-} \rightarrow V_{3,+}
\]
Temperley-Lieb: $TL_{n,\pm}(\delta)$ is the span (over $\mathbb{C}$) of non-crossing pairings of $2n$ points arranged around a circle, with formal addition.

**Example**

$$TL_3 = \text{Span}_\mathbb{C}\{ \begin{array}{c}
\ast \\
\ast \\
\ast \\
\ast \\
\ast
\end{array} \}.$$ 

Planar tangles act on $TL$ by inserting diagrams into empty disks, smoothing strings, and throwing out closed loops at a cost of $\cdot \delta$.

**Example**

$$\begin{array}{c}
\ast \\
\ast
\end{array} (\begin{array}{c}
\ast \\
\ast
\end{array}) = \begin{array}{c}
\ast \\
\ast
\end{array} = \delta^2$$
The standard invariant

The \textit{standard invariant} of a subfactor is the sequence of algebras

\[ \text{End}_{N,M}(X) \subset \text{End}_{N,M}(X \otimes^2) \subset \text{End}_{N,M}(X \otimes^3) \subset \cdots \]

together with its algebraic – planar algebraic – structure.

\textbf{Theorem (Jones)}

\textit{The standard invariant is a planar algebra.}

\textbf{Theorem (Popa)}

\textit{Subfactor planar algebras give subfactors, having the same index and principal graph.}

To paraphrase, this means constructing planar algebras is equivalent to constructing subfactors.
A subfactor planar algebra has

- $\dim V_{0,+} = \dim V_{0,-} = 1$;
- spherical trace: $\langle x, y \rangle = \text{tr}(y^* x)$ is positive definite.

From these properties, it follows that closed circles count for $\delta$, and $\delta = \sqrt{[M : N]}$. 
We will give a generators-and-relations construction of the extended Haagerup planar algebra.

The first step is to find a generator inside a larger planar algebra, where calculations are straightforward.

Next, we prove some relations on our generator inside this planar algebra.

Finally, we need to prove we have enough relations to guarantee that $S$ generates a subfactor planar algebra.
If the extended Haagerup graph is the graph of a subfactor planar algebra, what can we say about that planar algebra?

It can be singly generated as a planar algebra, by an uncappable generator $S$ which is an eigenvector of rotation (of eigenvalue $-1$):

\[
\begin{align*}
\star \star S & = 0, \\
\star \star S & = 0, \ldots, \\
S & = -S
\end{align*}
\]

and satisfies the multiplicative relation

\[
8 S 8 S 8 = f^{(8)} \in TL_8
\]
Graph planar algebras

The graph planar algebra of a bipartite graph has

- loops based at an even/odd vertex of length $2k$ are a basis of $GPA(G)_{k,+}/GPA(G)_{k,-}$.
- the action of planar tangles is based on the concatenation of paths and the Frobenius-Perron eigenvector of $G$.

Though $GPA(G)$ is too big to be a subfactor planar algebra ($\dim GPA(G)_{0,+} = \#\{\text{even vertices}\} > 1$), it has a spherical trace and positive definite sesquilinear form. Further, closed circles in $GPA(G)$ count for $\delta$, the Frobenius-Perron eigenvalue of the graph.

Theorem (Jones, unpublished)

If $P$ is a finite depth subfactor planar algebra with principal graph $G$, $P \hookrightarrow GPA(G)$. 
Looking for an extended Haagerup generator

To construct the extended Haagerup subfactor, we start with the graph planar algebra of its principal graph $eH$.

$GPA(eH)_{8,+}$ is 148475-dimensional; luckily the subspace $X$ of uncappable, $\rho = -1$ elements of $GPA(eH)_{8,+}$ is only 19-dimensional. Unluckily, it is not natural in our given basis.

We find an element $S \in X$ which further satisfies

$$S^8 S^8 S^8 = f^{(8)}.$$  

$S$ can be written as a direct sum of 60 matrices, each of size less than 119 by 119. With computer assistance, we calculate the moments $\text{tr} (S^2)$, $\text{tr} (S^3)$, $\text{tr} (S^4)$.
Now, we use those moments and linear algebra to prove relations:

\[ f(18) \star 18 = i \frac{\sqrt{[8][10]}}{[9]} \]

\[ f(18) \star f(18) = 9 \]

\[ f(20) \star 20 = \frac{[2][20]}{[9][10]} \]

\[ f(20) \star f(20) = \]

E. Peters

The extended Haagerup planar algebra
Theorem

*These relations are sufficient to show that $S$ generates the extended Haagerup planar algebra.*

$GPA(eH)$ is almost a subfactor planar algebra; it is spherical and positive definite. All we are missing is $\dim V_{0,+} = \dim V_{0,-} = 1$.

If $S$ generates a sufficiently small planar algebra (i.e., $\dim PA(S)_0 = 1$), then $PA(S)$ is a subfactor planar algebra. Further, $PA(S)$ must be the extended Haagerup planar algebra, because this is the only possible principal graph with

$$
\delta = \sqrt{\frac{8}{3} + \frac{1}{3} \sqrt[3]{\frac{13}{2}} \left(-5 - 3i\sqrt{3}\right) + \frac{1}{3} \sqrt[3]{\frac{13}{2}} \left(-5 + 3i\sqrt{3}\right)} \approx 2.09218.
$$

E. Peters

The extended Haagerup planar algebra
The Jellyfish algorithm, part I

To show $PA(S)_{0,+}$ and $PA(S)_{0,-}$ are one-dimensional, we need an evaluation algorithm: a way to reduce any closed diagram in $S$s to a multiple of the empty diagram.

Our algorithm works by letting the copies of our generator $S$ ‘swim to the surface,’ and then removing them in pairs.

The relations we just saw let us pull $S$ through a strand. Use this to bring all generators to the outside (multiplying if necessary).
The jellyfish algorithm in action

Begin with arbitrary planar network of $S$s.
The jellyfish algorithm in action

Begin with arbitrary planar network of $S$s.

Now float each generator to the surface, using the relation.
The jellyfish algorithm in action

Begin with arbitrary planar network of $S$s.

Now float each generator to the surface, using the relation.
The jellyfish algorithm in action

Begin with arbitrary planar network of $S$s.

Now float each generator to the surface, using the relation.
The jellyfish algorithm in action

Begin with arbitrary planar network of $S$s.

Now float each generator to the surface, using the relation.
The Jellyfish algorithm, part II

Now we have a polygon with some diagonals, labelled by the numbers of strands connecting generators.

- Each such polygon has an isolated vertex. The generator there is connected to one of its neighbors by at least 8 strands.
- Use $S^2 = f^{(8)}$ to reduce the number of generators, and repeat until zero or one copies of the generator remain. The resulting picture is then in Temperley-Lieb, or zero.
In summary: $S$ generates a subfactor planar algebra, with index $\delta^2 \approx 4.37722$; this must be the extended Haagerup planar algebra.